



Received for publication: August 3, 2018
Accepted: October 20, 2018

Original paper

***In vitro* test of inhibition effect of extracts from three seaweed species distributed at Black sea on different pathogens potentially dangerous for aquaponics**

IVAYLO SIRAKOV^{1*}, KATYA VELICHKOVA¹, NIKOLINA RUSENOVA², TONCHO DINEV³

¹Trakia University, Faculty of Agriculture, Department of Biology and Aquaculture, Students campus, 6014 Stara Zagora, Bulgaria

²Trakia University, Faculty of Agriculture, Department of Veterinary Microbiology, Infectious and Parasitic Diseases, Students campus, 6014 Stara Zagora, Bulgaria

³Trakia University, Faculty of Agriculture, Department of Biochemistry, Microbiology and Physics, Students campus, 6014 Stara Zagora, Bulgaria

Abstract

Aquaponics is innovative recirculation system where hydrobionts are cultivated together with the plants. The possibilities for control of pathogens in these systems are highly restricted. One possible strategy for inhibition of pathogenic microorganisms in aquaponics is the usage of seaweeds extracts. The study connected with the investigation of inhibition effect of seaweeds from Bulgarian Black sea coast on different pathogens is rare. The aim of current study was to test *In vitro* the inhibition effect of three seaweed species (*Ulva rigida*, *Cladophora vagabunda*, and *Ceramium rubrum*) distributed at Black sea in front of Bulgarian coast on different pathogens (bacteria and fungi) which are potentially harmful to hydrobionts, plants and consumer of aquaponics products. The ethanol and methanol extracts from investigated seaweed species were prepared. They were tested with agar well diffusion method against the following fish, food borne and plant pathogens: *Staphylococcus aureus*, *Escherichia coli*, *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*, *Bacillus cereus*, *Salmonella typhimurium*, *Candida albicans*, *Penicillium verrucosum* var. *verrucosum*, *Fusarium graminearum*, *Fusarium moniliforme* and *Aspergillus ochraceus*. The current study showed that the following extracts from seaweeds distributed in front of Bulgarian Black sea coast possess high inhibition effect (size of inhibition zone higher than 10 mm) against potentially pathogenic microorganisms in aquaponics: ethanol extract of *C. vagabunda* against *B. cereus* and *A. ochraceus*, methanol extract of *C. vagabunda* against *C. albicans*, ethanol extract of *C. rubrum* against *E.coli*, *B. cereus* and *C. albicans*.

Keywords

: Aquaponics, *in vitro* tests, inhibition effect, seaweeds, pathogens

To cite this article: SIRAKOV I, VELICHKOVA K, RUSENOVA N, DINEV T. *In vitro* test of inhibition effect of extracts from three seaweed species distributed at Black sea on different pathogens potentially dangerous for aquaponics. *Rom Biotechnol Lett.* 2019; 24(1): 176-183. DOI: 10.25083/rbl/24.1/176.183

✉ *Corresponding author: IVAYLO SIRAKOV, Trakia University, Faculty of Agriculture, Department of Biology and Aquaculture, Students campus, 6014 Stara Zagora, Bulgaria
E-mail: ivailo_sir@abv.bg

Introduction

Earth's population will continue to grow up to 9 billion by 2050 (UN, [1]). In order to meet the needs of the continuously growing population, it is necessary to develop technologies that allow a significant proportion of food products to be produced directly in the cities. Thus will reducing the pollution of the environment and lowering transportation costs. One such technology, which allows the cultivation of hydrobionts and plants to be integrated into the urban environment, is aquaponics (GRABER & al. [2]).

Along with the many advantages that this technology possess, one of its disadvantages is that the pathways for reducing the pathogenic microorganisms in it are restricted as the use of pesticides can lead to the toxic effects in the cultivated hydrobionts from one side and on the other hand, the use of the therapeutics on the hydrobionts can lead to their accumulation in plants (RAKOCY & al. [3]).

In aquaculture a large number of microorganisms are referred as a fish pathogens, or potentially dangerous for the humans i.e. *S. aureus* (SHAH & al. [4]), *E. coli* (NEWELL & al. [5]; SHIN & al.[6]), *B. cereus* (KOLANJINATHAN & al. [7]), *S. typhimurium* SHIN & al.[6]), *P. aeruginosa* (CHOUDHURY & [8]), *C. albicans* (PEREIRA & [9]). Therefore, their control in aquaponic systems is of the great importance for the aquaponics hobbyist as well as for the commercial aquaponics farms.

From the other side, the higher humidity in aquaponics greenhouses contributes to the development of pathogenic fungi (from genus *Aspergillus*, *Fusarium*, and *Penicillium*) which are potentially harmful to the plants and could decrease their productivity or deteriorate its commercial realization.

One method proposed by SIRAKOV & al. [10] to solve this disadvantage is the isolation of beneficial bacteria and their use in the control of pathogenic microorganisms associated with hydrobionts and plants. Another possibility is the use of synbiotics in the aquaponic systems, which can improve the immune system of the fish and the metabolism in the cultivated plants (SIRAKOV & al. [11]).

Different approach to diseases control in aquaponic systems is the use of extracts from different plants and it still remains not investigated. Numerous

studies have shown the possibility of using extracts of different plants to control pathogens in hydrobionts, plants or for consumers of agriculture production. Studies investigating the possible double effect of the application of extracts from different plants on hydrobionts and plants pathogens as well as on potentially harmful for the consumer of aquaponic products microorganisms are rare.

One of the possible groups of plants that could be used in this battlefield against pathogenic microorganisms is algae. The effect of their use is strongly dependent of intraspecific variability in the production of second metabolites related to seasonal variation and location of their yield (LIMA-FILHO & al. [12]; TÜNEY & al. [13]; PÉREZ *et al.* [14]). Studies investigating the antimicrobial potential of seaweed from the Black Sea, in front of the Bulgarian coast on various pathogens, are very limited (KAMENARSKA & al. [15]). The antibacterial effect of the following seaweeds species collected from Bulgarian Black sea coast was tested: *Bangia fuscopurpurea*, *Halimtilon virgatum*, *Corallina elongata*, *Gelidium spinosum*, *Callithamnion granulatum*, *Ceramium diaphanum var. elegans*, *Chondrophycus papillosus*, *Laurencia coronopus*, *Polysiphonia denudate*, *Polysiphonia denudate f. fragilis*, *Stilophora tenella*, *Punctaria latifolia*, *Punctaria plantaginea*, *Colpomenia peregrina*, *Scytosiphon lomentaria*, *Zanardinia prototypus* and *Cystoseira crinite* (KAMENARSKA & al.[15]) .

The aim of current study was to test *in vitro* the inhibition effect of three seaweed species (*Ulva rigida* C. Agardh, *Cladophora vagabunda* (L.) C. Hoek, and *Ceramium rubrum* (Huds.) C. Agardh) distributed at Black sea in front of Bulgarian coast on different pathogens (bacteria and fungi) which are potentially harmful to hydrobionts, plants and consumers of aquaponics products.

Materials and Methods

1. Preparation of Seaweed for extraction

Three seaweeds species (*Ulva rigida* C. Agardh, *Cladophora vagabunda* (L.) C. Hoek, and *Ceramium rubrum* (Huds. C. Agardh) were collected from coastal areas of Black sea, south from Burgas (Tzarevo municipality, Lozenets village, Bulgaria)

(42°12'32.1"N 27°48'40.0"E). The seaweeds were determined by DIMITROVA-KONAKLIEVA [16]. They were prepared for extraction according to SUJATHA & al. [17] with slight modification. The collected seaweeds were transported to laboratory prior washing them with sea water. The remaining animal castings, sand particles attached debris were removed by soaking them in tap water, followed by rinsing with sterile water. Afterward, the excess water removed by blotting them on filter papers and dried on shade in an air-conditioned room for one week at 20°C and cut into small pieces. They were dried in an oven at 37°C and powder of them was prepared with the help of electric grinder.

2. Extraction procedure

The process of extraction was made by soaking algae's powder in 100% ethanol solvent (1:10 w/v) for 24 hours. The received materials were concentrated in a rotary evaporator to reduce the volume. The received extracts were filtered through a syringe filter with 0.2 µm pore size and collected in plastic containers. The containers were placed at refrigerator until antimicrobial tests to be started. The same procedure was used for the preparation of methanol extracts of seaweeds. The concentration of the methanol used for the extraction procedure was 100%.

3. Tested pathogens

In the current study the antibacterial activity of seaweed's extracts against the following potentially harmful for fish and humans pathogens were tested: referent bacterial strains-Staphylococcus aureus ATCC25923, Escherichia coli ATCC25922, Pseudomonas aeruginosa ATCC 27853 and clinical isolates - Bacillus cereus, Salmonella typhimurium, and Candida albicans. The strains were kept at refrigerator at -20°C. Prior to their use in inhibition tests, they were recovered at tryptic soy blood agar (Himedia, India).

The plant's mould strains examined were Penicillium verrucosum var. verrucosum 2003 NRRL F-143, Fusarium graminearum 2294 IMI 155426, Fusarium moniliforme 394 Strain FN-9 and Aspergillus ochraceus 2002 IM-BAS.

4. Test of antimicrobial activity of seaweed's extracts against pathogens

Antimicrobial tests with fish and foodborne pathogens

The extracts (methanol and ethanol) were tested for antimicrobial activity by the diffusion method in wells (agar well method) (GHOSH & al. [18]) with some modifications consistent with the type of strains tested: instead of brain heart infusion agar was used Mueller Hinton agar (Himedia, India). The plates were incubated for 24 hours under aerobic conditions instead of microaerophilic. Briefly, from 24 h bacterial and yeast colonies of trypticase soy blood agar, inoculums were prepared in physiological saline corresponding to 0.5 of the McFarland standard (1.5×10^8 cfu.mL⁻¹). The wells were formed with a sterile 6 mm diameter well probe at the distance of 2 cm from the center after pre-application of the inoculum with a sterile cotton swab. The wells were filled with 100 µl of the extracts. Positive control with gentamicin at a concentration of 12.5 µg.mL⁻¹ and negative with the respective solvents was performed. The wells were incubated at 37°C for 24 hours under aerobic conditions. Antimicrobial activity was assessed in the presence of a growth suppression zone of ≥ 8.0 mm (MOHAMMADI-SICHANI & al. [19]). Tests were performed three times to determine the reproducibility of the results.

Antimicrobial tests with plant pathogens

The methanolic and ethanolic plant extracts were screened for antifungal activity by agar well diffusion method (PEREZ & al. [20]). The 72 hours old fungal cultures were grown on potato glucose agar (glucose 20.0 g, potatoes 200.0 g, yeast extract 2.0 g, agar 20.0 g, pH 5.6). 20 mL of potato glucose agar was poured in every Petri dish. After solidification, 0.1 mL inoculum of the fungal strains ($1-2 \times 10^4$ CFU.mL⁻¹) was introduced on the surface of the agar plate and the wells were made by using sterile cork borer of size 6.0mm. 0.1ml of methanolic and ethanolic plant extracts were introduced in the wells. An incubation period of 3-7 days at 23^o C was maintained for observation of antifungal activity of plant extracts. The antifungal activity was evaluated by measuring zones of inhibition of fungal growth surrounding the plant extracts in the wells. The zones of inhibition were

measured in mm and the experiment was carried out in triplicates. Antifungal activity was assumed in the presence of an inhibition zone ≥ 8.0 mm. The complete antifungal analysis was carried out under strict aseptic conditions. Methanol and ethanol were used as a negative solvent control.

6. Data analysis

The antimicrobial tests were conducted in a completely randomized design with three repetitions, for each treatment. The received data were analyzed by ANOVA single factor at a significance level of $P < 0.05$. The analyses were made by using the SPSS program.

Results and Discussions

1. Antimicrobial tests with fish and foodborne pathogens

The current In vitro test showed advantageously low and moderate inhibition effect of tested seaweeds extracts (*U. rigida*, *Cl. vagabunda*, and *C. rubrum*) against fish and foodborne pathogens (Table 1). The ethanol and methanol extracts of *U. rigida* showed

lower than 10 mm inhibition zone in antagonistic tests against tested pathogens (Table 1). They showed the highest inhibition effect against fish pathogen *S. aureus* and it was higher with 60% than the average size of inhibition zone found out for the control variant. The ethanol and methanol extracts of *Cl. vagabunda* showed the highest inhibition effect against *B. cereus* and *C. albicans* and the inhibition zones were higher respectively with 71.6% and 103% compared with the sizes of inhibition zone found for the control variants. The sizes of inhibition zone of ethanol extract of *C. rubrum* in vitro tests with pathogens *E. coli*, *B. cereus* and *C. albicans* was higher respectively with 68.1%, 66.6%, and 84.3% compared with the size of inhibition zone in control variant where only ethanol's inhibition effect was tested.

The positive control showed the higher inhibition effect of Gentamicin against tested fish and foodborne pathogens compared with the tested seaweeds extracts except for *S. typhimurium* where the ethanol extract of *Cl. vagabunda* showed the highest inhibition effect (8.6 ± 0.4) (Table 1).

Table 1. The diameter of inhibition zone of antimicrobial screening of algae extracts determined by the agar diffusion method

Test algae extract	<i>S. aureus</i>	<i>E. coli</i>	<i>B. cereus</i>	<i>S. typhimurium</i>	<i>P. aeruginosa</i>	<i>C. albicans</i>
<i>Ulva rigida</i> EtOH	9.6 \pm 1.15*	9.3 \pm 0.5*	8.3 \pm 0.5*	8 \pm 0.5*	8 \pm 0.5*	9 \pm 0.5*
<i>Ulva rigida</i> MeOH	9.6 \pm 1.15*	8 \pm 0.2*	8 \pm 0.5*	7 \pm 0.7 ^{ns}	8.06 \pm 0.15*	9.1 \pm 0.1*
<i>Cladophora vagabunda</i> EtOH	9.6 \pm 0.5*	9.3 \pm 0.5*	10.3 \pm 0.5*	8.6 \pm 0.4*	8.3 \pm 0.5*	9.3 \pm 1.15*
<i>Cladophora vagabunda</i> MeOH	9.5 \pm 0.5*	8.1 \pm 0.1*	7.9 \pm 0.45*	7.4 \pm 0.5*	7.1 \pm 0.1*	12.2 \pm 0.8*
<i>Ceramium rubrum</i> EtOH	9.3 \pm 0.5*	10.1 \pm 0.4*	10 \pm 0.3*	7.9 \pm 0.2*	8.2 \pm 0.2*	11.06 \pm 0.2*
<i>Ceramium rubrum</i> MeOH	7.9 \pm 0.4*	7.7 \pm 0.3	6.2 \pm 0.2 ^{ns}	6.1 \pm 0.1 ^{ns}	8.1 \pm 0.1*	9.03 \pm 0.3*
EtOH	-	-	-	-	-	-
MeOH	-	-	-	-	-	-
Gentamicin	21.1 \pm 0.4*	17.3 \pm 0.2*	23.0 \pm 0.4*	-	15 \pm 0.2*	

Diameter of inhibition zone (mm) against plant's mould (Staphylococcus aureus ATCC25923, Escherichia coli ATCC25922, Bacillus cereus (clinical isolate), Salmonella Typhimurium (clinical isolate), Pseudomonas aeruginosa ATCC 27853) and fungal strain Candida albicans (clinical isolate), EtOH=Ethanol, MeOH=Methanol; diameter of inhibition zone equal to 6 mm =absence of inhibition effect (-), diameter of inhibition zone in range from 6 mm to 8.5 mm=low inhibition effect, diameter of inhibition effect in range from 8.6 mm to 10mm=moderate inhibition effect; diameter of inhibition zone equal or higher than 10 mm =higher inhibition effect; Asterisk (*) denotes a significant different at P<0.05, ns Difference not statistically significant;

Antimicrobial tests with plant pathogens
The inhibition effect of tested seaweeds extracts against plant's pathogenic fungi was lower than this found out for fish and foodborne pathogens (Table 2). The highest inhibition effect was found out for ethanol extract of Cladophora vagabunda against Aspergillus ochraceus and the inhibition

zone was higher with 68.3% compared with the size of inhibition zone in the control variant. The moderate inhibition effect was also observed in tests conducted with the ethanol extracts of Cladophora vagabunda and C.rubrum respectively against Aspergillus ochraceus and Fusarium moniliforme (Table 2).

Table 2. Inhibition of mycelial growth of different plant pathogens affected by different herbal extracts

Test algae extract	<i>Aspergillus ochraceus</i>	<i>Fusarium moniliforme</i>	<i>Fusarium graminearum</i>	<i>Penicillium verrucosum</i>
<i>Ulva rigida</i> EtOH	-	-	-	7,1±0.1*
<i>Ulva rigida</i> MeOH	-	-	7±0.3 ^{ns}	-
<i>Cladophora vagabunda</i> EtOH	10.1±0.1*	7.5±0.5 ^{ns}	-	-
<i>Cladophora vagabunda</i> MeOH	8.5±0.3*	9±0.4*	8±0.2*	7±0.1*
<i>Ceramium rubrum</i> EtOH	9±0.1*	-	-	-
<i>Ceramium rubrum</i> MeOH	8±0.2*	-	-	-
<i>EtOH</i>	-	-	-	-
<i>MeOH</i>	-	-	-	-

Diameter of inhibition zone (mm) against plant's fungi strains (Penicillium verrucosum var. verrucosum 2003 NRRL F-143, Fusarium graminearum 2294 IMI 155426, Fusarium moniliforme 394 Strain FN-9 and Aspergillus ochraceus 2002 IM-BAS.), EtOH=Ethanol, MeOH=Methanol; diameter of inhibition zone equal to 6 mm =absence of inhibition effect (-), diameter of inhibition zone in range from 6 mm to 8.5 mm=low inhibition effect, diameter of inhibition effect in range from 8.6 mm to 10mm=moderate inhibition effect; diameter of inhibition zone equal or higher than 10 mm =higher inhibition effect; Asterisk (*) denotes a significant different at P<0.05, ns Difference not statistically significant;

Our study showed the low antagonistic activity of methanol and ethanol extracts of *Ulva rigida* against tested pathogens and received results were similar to the results received from TÜNEY & al. [13] where the same seaweed species from Aegean sea were tested for the antimicrobial activity. The current tests were conducted with a dry matter of seaweeds which is distinguished with lower antagonistic effect against

pathogens compared to the higher antimicrobial activity found out in a fresh matter of seaweeds possible due to the lower quantity of volatile compounds or fatty acids in the samples according to TÜNEY & al. [13]. We did not find differences in antimicrobial activity in an extract of *Ulva rigida* when different solvents were used (methanol and ethanol). TÜNEY & al. [13] found strong inhibition effect

against different pathogens when diethyl ether was used as a solvent resulted probably in different content or quantity of active substances which were extracted during the extraction process.

The current test with *Cladophora vagabunda* showed high antagonistic effect against bacterial pathogen *B. cereus* and pathogenic fungus *C. albicans* and *A. ochraceus* and moderate antagonistic effect against pathogenic micro-organisms *S. aureus*, *E. coli*, *S. typhimurium* and *Fusarium moniliforme*. Our study is in confirmation of research made by HORINCAR & al. [21] which determined the antagonistic effect of *C. vagabunda* collected from the Romanian Black sea against *S. enteritidis*, *B. subtilis*, and *E. coli*. The same authors explored the volatile composition and fatty acids content and found that the main volatile components presented in *C. vagabunda* are hexanal (11.2%), octane (9.8%), nonanal (6.7%), octanal (6.7%), 2,5,5-trimethyl-2-hexene (4.7%), 3-hexen-2-one (4%), and *o*-cymene (3.6%) and fatty acid composition was composed generally of palmitic and arachidonic acids. HORINCAR & al. [21] found out that MUFAs and PUFAs content in *C. vagabunda* was 42%.

Ethanol extract of *Ceramium rubrum* showed a high antagonistic effect against *E. coli*, *B. cereus* and *C. albicans* during conducted from us *In vitro* tests. The study made by CORTÉS & al. [22] showed that the antimicrobial ability of *C. rubrum* primarily results from the availability of the lipophilic extract. Other study showed that the type of solvent has a primary meaning for antibacterial activity of *C. rubrum* because a different type of solvent has different antimicrobial capabilities and it was demonstrated that that methanol extract from *C. rubrum* seaweed had a higher inhibitory effect than nonpolar *n*-hexane extract (DUBBER & al. [23]). In our study, the ethanol's extract showed a higher antagonistic effect in *C. rubrum*.

Another factor influenced antimicrobial activity in seaweeds is the geographical location (HELLIO & al. [24]). The microbiological investigation of antagonistic activity of seaweeds in front of Bulgarian coast are limited (KAMENARSKA & al. [15]) and present commercial interest.

The antagonistic effect of seaweeds against pathogenic microorganisms is promoted mainly from

the content of two group compounds- volatile compounds and fatty acids. Inhibition effect of volatile compounds is connected with the significant changes in membrane permeability in cells of pathogens (TROMBETTA & al. [25]). It is already known that polyunsaturated fatty acids could kill pathogenic microorganisms by disrupting their cell membrane, leading to cell lysis (LE *et al.* [26]). These characteristics made from seaweeds possible object for biological treatment of pathogens in such multifunctional system as the aquaponics where the fish and plants are presenting.

Conclusions

The current study showed that the following extracts from seaweeds distributed in front of Bulgarian Black sea coast possess high inhibition effect against potentially pathogenic microorganisms in aquaponics: ethanol extract of *C. vagabunda* against *B. cereus* and *A. ochraceus*, the methanol extract of *C. vagabunda* against *C. albicans*, the ethanol extract of *C. rubrum* against *E. coli*, *B. cereus*, and *C. albicans*. The future study connected with different doses and the ways of application of seaweeds extracts possess antimicrobial activity should be tested *in vivo* in the aquaponics.

Conflict of interest disclosure

There are no known conflicts of interest in the publication of this article. The manuscript was read and approved by all authors.

Compliance with ethical standards

Any aspect of the work covered in this manuscript has been conducted with the ethical approval of all relevant bodies and that such approvals are acknowledged within the manuscript.

Acknowledgments

This study was supported by the project 1AF/17 and 8AF/18.

References

1. UN, World Population Prospects: The 1998 Revision, vol. I, Comprehensive Tables (UN

- Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division, New York (1999).
2. A. GRABER, M. DURNO, R. GAUS, A. MATHIS, R. JUNGE, UF001 LokDepot, Basel: The first commercial rooftop aquaponic farm in Switzerland. In International Conference on Vertical Farming and Urban Agriculture A, Vol. 16, pp. 1-24 (2014).
 3. J.E. RAKOCY, M.P. MASSER, T.M. LOSORDO, Recirculating aquaculture tank production systems: aquaponics—integrating fish and plant culture. SRAC publication, 454, pp.1-16 (2006).
 4. K.L. SHAH, B.C. TYAGI, An eye disease in silver carp, *Hypophthalmichthys molitrix*, held in tropical ponds, associated with the bacterium *Staphylococcus aureus*. *Aquaculture*, 55(1), pp.1-4 (1986).
 5. D.G. NEWELL, M. KOOPMANS, L. VERHOEF, E. DUIZER, A. AIDARA-KANE, H. SPRONG, M. OPSTEEGH, M. LANGELAAR, J. THREFALL, F. SCHEUTZ, J. VAN DER GIESSEN, Foodborne diseases—the challenges of 20 years ago still persist while new ones continue to emerge. *International journal of food microbiology*, 139, pp.S3-S15 (2010).
 6. J.H. SHIN, S. CHANG, D.H. KANG, Application of antimicrobial ice for reduction of foodborne pathogens (*Escherichia coli* O157: H7, *Salmonella* Typhimurium, *Listeria monocytogenes*) on the surface of fish. *Journal of applied microbiology*, 97(5), pp. 916-922 (2004).
 7. K. KOLANJINATHAN, P. GANESH, M. GOVINDARAJAN, Antibacterial activity of ethanol extracts of seaweeds against fish bacterial pathogens. *Eur Rev Med Pharmacol Sci*, 13(3), pp.173-177 (2009).
 8. S. CHOUDHURY, A. SREE, S.C. MUKHERJEE, P. PATNAIK, M. BAPUJII, In vitro antibacterial activity of extracts of selected marine algae and mangroves against fish pathogens. *Asian fisheries science*, 18(3/4), pp.285-294 (2005).
 9. J.A. PEREIRA, I. OLIVEIRA, A. SOUSA, P. VALENTÃO, P.B. ANDRADE, I.C. FERREIRA, F. FERRERES, A. BENTO, R. SEABRA, L. ESTEVINHO, Walnut (*Juglans regia* L.) leaves: phenolic compounds, antibacterial activity and antioxidant potential of different cultivars. *Food and Chemical Toxicology*, 45(11), pp.2287-2295 (2007).
 10. I. SIRAKOV, M. LUTZ, A. GRABER, A. MATHIS, Y. STAYKOV, T.H. SMITS, R. JUNGE, Potential for combined biocontrol activity against fungal fish and plant pathogens by bacterial isolates from a model aquaponic system. *Water*, 8(11), p.518 (2016).
 11. I. SIRAKOV, K. VELICHKOVA, S. STOYANOVA, M. KAYMAKANOVA, D. SLAVCHEVA-SIRAKOVA, R. ATANASOVA, Y. STAYKOV, Effect of symbiotic dietary supplementation on growth, physiological and immunological parameters in common carp (*Cyprinus carpio* L.) fingerlings and on yield and physiological parameters in mesocosmos aquaponic system. *Bulgarian Journal of Agricultural Science*, 24(1), pp.140-149 (2018).
 12. J.V.M. LIMA-FILHO, A.F. CARVALHO, S.M. FRETAS, V.M. Melo, Antibacterial activity of extracts of six macroalgae from the northeastern Brazilian coast. *Brazilian Journal of Microbiology*, 33(4), pp.311-314 (2002).
 13. I. TÜNEY, B.H. Cadirci, D. Ünal, A. Sukatar, Antimicrobial activities of the extracts of marine algae from the coast of Urla (Izmir, Turkey). *Turkish Journal of Biology*, 30(3), pp.171-175 (2006).
 14. M.J. PÉREZ, E. FALQUÉ, H. DOMINQUEZ, Antimicrobial action of compounds from marine seaweed. *Marine drugs*, 14(3), p.52 (2016).
 15. Z. KAMENARSKA, J. SERKEDJIEVA, H. NAJDENSKI, K. STEFANOV, I. TSVETKOVA, S. DIMITROVA-KONAKLIEVA, S. POPOV, Antibacterial, antiviral, and cytotoxic activities of some red and brown seaweeds from the Black Sea. *Botanica Marina*, 52(1), pp.80-86 (2009).
 16. S. DIMITROVA-KONAKLIEVA, Flora of seaweed in Bulgaria, Pensoft, Sofia, p. 304 (2001) (bg).
 17. L. SUJATHA, T. L. GOVARDHAN, G. S. RANGAIAH, Antibacterial activity of green seaweeds on oral bacteria. *Indian Journal of Natural Products and Resources*, 3(3), pp 328-333 (2012).

-
18. S. GHOSH, E. SUBUDHI, S. NAYAK, Antimicrobial assay of *Stevia rebaudiana* Bertoni leaf extracts against 10 pathogens. *Int. J. Integ. Biol.* 2:27-31 (2008).
19. M. MOHAMMADI-SICHANI, V. KARBASIZADEH, F. AGHAIL, M. REZA MOFID, Effect of different extracts of *Stevia rebaudiana* leaves on *Streptococcus mutans* growth. *Journal of Medicinal Plants Research* 6(32), pp. 4731-4734, (2012).
20. C. PEREZ, M. PAULI, P. BAZERQUE, An Antibiotic Assay by Agar Well Diffusion Method. *Acta Biologica et Medicinæ Experimentalis*, 15, 113-115 (1990).
21. V.B. HORINCAR, G. PARFENE, A.K. TYAGI, D. GOTTARDI, R. DINICĂ, M.E. GUERZONI, G. BAHRIM, Extraction and characterization of volatile compounds and fatty acids from red and green macroalgae from the Romanian Black Sea in order to obtain valuable bioadditives and biopreservatives. *Journal of applied phycology*, 26(1), pp.551-559 (2014).
22. Y. CORTÉS, E. HORMAZÁBAL, H. LEAL, A. URZÚA, A. MUTIS, L. PARRA A. QUIROZ, Novel antimicrobial activity of a dichloromethane extract obtained from red seaweed *Ceramium rubrum* (Hudson) (Rhodophyta: Florideophyceae) against *Yersinia ruckeri* and *Saprolegnia parasitica*, agents that cause diseases in salmonids. *Electronic Journal of Biotechnology*, 17(3), pp.126-131 (2014).
23. D. DUBBER, T. HARDER, Extracts of *Ceramium rubrum*, *Mastocarpus stellatus* and *Laminaria digitata* inhibit growth of marine and fish pathogenic bacteria at ecologically realistic concentrations. *Aquaculture*, 274:196–200, (2008).
24. C. HELLIO, J.P. MARECHAL, B. VERON, G. BREMER, A.S. CLARE, Y. LE GAL., Seasonal variation of antifouling activities of marine algae from the Brittany coast (France). *Marine Biotechnology*, 6(1), pp.67-82 (2004).
25. D. TROMBETTA, A. SAIJA, G. BISIGNANO, S. ARENA, S. CARUSO, G. MAZZANTI, N. UCCELA, F. CASTELLI, Study on the mechanisms of the antibacterial action of some plant α , β -unsaturated aldehydes. *Lett. Appl. Microbiol.* 35 (4), 285–290 (2002).
26. P.N.T. LE, A.P. DESBOIS, Antibacterial Effect of Eicosapentaenoic Acid against *Bacillus cereus* and *Staphylococcus aureus*: Killing Kinetics, Selection for Resistance, and Potential Cellular Target. *Marine drugs*, 15(11), p.334 (2017).